



# Efficacy of Entomopathogenic Fungi with Insecticides Mixtures against *Oxycarenus hyalinipennis* (Costa) (Lygaeidae: Hemiptera)

Khursheed Ahmed, Shoaib Freed\*, Rana Fartab Shoukat and Kanwar Waqas Ahmad

Laboratory of Insect Microbiology and Biotechnology, Department of Entomology, Faculty of Agricultural Sciences and Technology, Bahauddin Zakariya University, Multan

## ABSTRACT

Dusky cotton bug, *Oxycarenus hyalinipennis* has appeared as a serious insect pest of various crops including cotton. The present study was carried out to evaluate the combined effect of some isolates of *Beauveria bassiana*, *Metarhizium anisopliae* and *Isaria fumosorosea* and six synthetic insecticides *i.e.*, triazophos, imidacloprid, bifenthrin, nitenpyram, pyreproxifin and lambda cyhalothrin against *O. hyalinipennis*. The efficacy of these microbial agents could be enhanced by applying in combination with insecticides. Five concentrations *i.e.*,  $1 \times 10^6$ ,  $1 \times 10^7$ ,  $1 \times 10^8$ ,  $2 \times 10^8$  and  $3 \times 10^8$  conidia/ml of each isolate of entomopathogenic fungi were used in combination with insecticides against 5<sup>th</sup> instar nymphs of *O. hyalinipennis*. The combined treatment of isolates of entomopathogenic fungi and synthetic insecticides caused higher mortality of *O. hyalinipennis*. Moreover, the combined treatments decreased the adult emergence, male and female longevity, while increased the nymphal duration. The results indicated that these entomopathogenic fungi can provide better control in combination with insecticides and can be used in integrated pest management for reducing the population density of *O. hyalinipennis*.

## Article Information

Received 21 February 2017

Revised 23 July 2018

Accepted 28 February 2019

Available online 20 January 2020

## Authors' Contribution

KA performed experiment and wrote the manuscript. SF provided technical assistance, supervision and helped in writing manuscript. RFS and KWA performed statistical analysis, assisted in experiments and manuscript writing.

## Key words

*Oxycarenus hyalinipennis*, Entomopathogenic fungi, Microbial control, Insecticides, Dusky cotton bug.

## INTRODUCTION

Cotton, *Gossypium hirsutum* L. is a critical fiber crop and exportable produce of Pakistan which contributes 7.0 % to the national economy and 1.7% of the Gross Domestic Product (GDP) of Pakistan (Farooq, 2014). There are numerous factors which contribute for the low cotton production, while insect pests including chewing and sucking are the major factor for lowering the yield of cotton (Shah, 2014; Akram *et al.*, 2013; Sammaiah *et al.*, 2012; Patil and Rajankanth 2005). Yunus and Yousuf (1979) stated that nearly 93 different insects and mites attack on cotton crop that damage the cotton crop in different ways either by sucking the cell sap or eating different parts of plant, causing 20-40% yield loss (Aslam *et al.*, 2004).

The use of insecticides is the common strategy adapted by the farmers for control of *Oxycarenus hyalinipennis*. About 90% farmers use insecticides against insect pests to protect their crops (Prayogo *et al.*, 2005). However, the unnecessary use of insecticides create problem including resistance (Wang *et al.*, 2011). Owing to these reasons, alternate methods of insect pest's management including

biological control using insect pathogenic organisms have several advantages including low costs, safe for beneficial insects, more efficient and eco-friendly than the conventional insecticides (Carruthers and Hural, 1990; Lacey *et al.*, 2001; Freed *et al.*, 2012). Fungal biocontrol agents have different mode of action than other micro-organisms by invading their hosts directly through cuticle rather than ingestion. This is the reason that insect pathogenic fungi can infect eggs (Ujian and Shahzad, 2007; Anand and Tiwary, 2009) and pupae of the insects (Nguyen *et al.*, 2007; Anand *et al.*, 2008).

Another strategy to increase the efficacy of entomopathogenic fungi is the combined application with insecticides. The studies report that the insecticides application increased the efficacy of fungus making these bicontrol agents more effective for pest management (Quintela and McCoy, 1998; Dayakar *et al.*, 2000; Hiromori and Nishigaki, 2001; Serebrov *et al.*, 2005; Purwar and Sachan, 2006; Rachapa *et al.*, 2007). Combined use of insecticides and entomogenous fungi can increase the efficacy by reducing the quantity of insecticides, minimizing the environmental hazards and resistance in pests (Moino and Alves, 1998; Quintela and McCoy, 1998). Keeping in view the importance of emerging economic insect pests in cotton, the study was planned to evaluate the efficacy of mixtures of entomopathogenic fungi with insecticides against *O. hyalinipennis*.

\* Corresponding author: [sfared@bzu.edu.pk](mailto:sfared@bzu.edu.pk)  
0030-9923/2020/0002-0573 \$ 9.00/0  
Copyright 2020 Zoological Society of Pakistan

## MATERIALS AND METHODS

### *Oxycarenus hyalinipennis*

The nymphs and adults of dusky cotton bug *O. hyalinipennis* were collected from the cotton fields. These insects were reared in plastic jars on cotton leaves in the laboratory. The jars openings were covered with muslin cloth. Cotton seeds were also placed in the jars as egg laying medium. Rearing of insects was carried out at temperature  $28 \pm 1^\circ\text{C}$ , relative humidity 60-70% and 14:10 light: dark photoperiod.

### Fungal culture and concentrations

Isolates of *Metarhizium anisopliae* (Ma-11.1, Ma-2.4, isolated from soil), *Isaria fumosorosea* (If-03, If-02, isolated from soil and Rove beetle) and *Beauveria bassiana* (Bb-01, Bb-10, isolated from soil) were used from the laboratory maintained culture. The required concentrations i.e.,  $1 \times 10^6$ -  $3 \times 10^8$  conidia/ml of each isolate were made by serial dilution method.

### Preparation of insecticide concentrations

Insecticides, bifenthrin, lambda cyhalothrin, nitenpyram, imidacloprid, triazophos, and pyreproxifin were used to check the efficacy against *O. hyalinipennis*. Required concentrations of each insecticide i.e., 0.005, 0.0025, 0.00125, 0.000625 and 0.00031 ppm were prepared by serial dilution method.

**Table I.- Calculated doses of fungi (conidia/ml) and insecticides (ppm) for binary treatments.**

|                        | LC <sub>40</sub>   | LC <sub>30</sub>   | LC <sub>20</sub>   | LC <sub>10</sub>   |
|------------------------|--------------------|--------------------|--------------------|--------------------|
| <b>Fungal isolates</b> |                    |                    |                    |                    |
| Bb-01                  | $2.01 \times 10^7$ | $1.56 \times 10^7$ | $1.22 \times 10^7$ | $1.01 \times 10^7$ |
| Bb-10                  | $3.75 \times 10^7$ | $3.18 \times 10^7$ | $2.98 \times 10^7$ | $2.65 \times 10^7$ |
| Ma-2.4                 | $4.01 \times 10^8$ | $3.65 \times 10^8$ | $3.22 \times 10^8$ | $2.67 \times 10^8$ |
| Ma-1.1                 | $2.01 \times 10^7$ | $1.73 \times 10^7$ | $1.32 \times 10^7$ | $1.01 \times 10^7$ |
| If-02                  | $4.67 \times 10^7$ | $4.19 \times 10^7$ | $3.87 \times 10^7$ | $3.12 \times 10^7$ |
| If-03                  | $3.43 \times 10^8$ | $3.21 \times 10^8$ | $2.76 \times 10^8$ | $2.18 \times 10^8$ |
| <b>Insecticides</b>    |                    |                    |                    |                    |
| Triazophos             | 0.00073            | 0.00067            | 0.00061            | 0.0005             |
| Imidacloprid           | 0.00058            | 0.0005             | 0.00044            | 0.00037            |
| Pyreproxifin           | 0.00067            | 0.00064            | 0.00058            | 0.00053            |
| Nitenpyram             | 0.00062            | 0.00056            | 0.00051            | 0.00045            |
| Lambda cyhalothrin     | 0.00057            | 0.0005             | 0.00043            | 0.00036            |
| Bifenthrin             | 0.00065            | 0.00059            | 0.00056            | 0.00049            |

### Preparation of binary mixtures of insecticides and fungi

The desired concentrations (LC<sub>40</sub>, LC<sub>30</sub>, LC<sub>20</sub> and LC<sub>10</sub>) of fungi and insecticides were calculated by conducting preliminary experiments (Table I). Binary

mixture of insecticides and entomopathogenic fungi was made by mixing the LC<sub>10</sub> fungi + LC<sub>10</sub> insecticides, LC<sub>20</sub> fungi + LC<sub>20</sub> insecticides, LC<sub>30</sub> fungi + LC<sub>30</sub> insecticides and LC<sub>40</sub> fungi + LC<sub>40</sub> insecticides.

### Bioassay

The experiment was conducted under complete randomized design with four replications having ten insects per replication. Immersion method was used in which 5<sup>th</sup> instar nymphs of *O. hyalinipennis* were individually immersed in the combined concentrations of entomopathogenic fungi and insecticides for 8-10 seconds. To soak up the excessive moisture the insects were placed on tissue paper. While, in the control treatment, insects were treated with Tween 80 (0.05%) solution only. These treated insects were then transferred into petri dishes provided with fresh cotton leaves. The mortality data was recorded for consecutive 7 days. After seven days the remaining alive insects were reared again and were kept under examination to assess the effect of binary mixture on the survival and biological parameters of *O. hyalinipennis*.

### Data analysis

All the values (LC<sub>10</sub>, LC<sub>20</sub>, LC<sub>30</sub>, and LC<sub>40</sub>) of insecticides and entomopathogenic fungi were calculated by Probit analysis by using POLO-PC software (LeOra Software, 2003). The means were compared by LSD test at 0.05 probability levels and analyzed by analytical software (Statistix version 8.1).

## RESULTS

### Percent mortality of *O. hyalinipennis*

Mortality of 5<sup>th</sup> instar nymphs of *O. hyalinipennis* after the application of mixtures of entomopathogenic fungi and insecticides are presented in Table II. An increasing trend of mortality was found towards higher concentration of insecticides and fungi combinations in a dose dependent manner. In case of mixtures of insect pathogenic fungi and insecticides, the highest percent mortality ( $\pm$ SE) ( $90.0 \pm 4.0$ ) was recorded in case of combined use of higher doses of isolate Bb-01 (LC<sub>40</sub>) and bifenthrin (LC<sub>40</sub>), and Bb-10 (LC<sub>40</sub>) with bifenthrin and triazophos followed by the LC<sub>40</sub> of Bb-01 and LC<sub>40</sub> of nitenpyram and LC<sub>40</sub> of isolate Ma-11.1 (LC<sub>40</sub>) and LC<sub>40</sub> of triazophos.

The results regarding entomopathogenic fungi (LC<sub>30</sub>) and insecticides (LC<sub>30</sub>) mixture showed highest percent mortality ( $\pm$ SE) ( $82.5 \pm 4.7$ ) in Bb-01 (LC<sub>30</sub>) and bifenthrin (LC<sub>30</sub>) while in case of entomopathogenic fungi (LC<sub>20</sub>) and insecticides (LC<sub>20</sub>) mixture, highest percent mortality ( $75.0 \pm 6.4$ ) was caused by Bb-01 (LC<sub>20</sub>) and bifenthrin (LC<sub>20</sub>). Moreover, in case of LC<sub>10</sub> highest percent mortality ( $75.5 \pm 4.7$ ) was observed for If-03 (LC<sub>10</sub>) and bifenthrin (LC<sub>10</sub>).

**Table II.- Percent nymphal mortality of *O. hyalinipennis* after treatment of binary mixture of entomopathogenic fungi and insecticides.**

|  | Triazophos | Imidacloprid | Pyreproxifen | Nitenpyram | Lambda cyhalothrin | Bifenthrin |
|--|------------|--------------|--------------|------------|--------------------|------------|
| <b>LC<sub>10</sub> + LC<sub>10</sub></b> |            |              |              |            |                    |            |
| Bb-01                                    | 50.0±7.1a  | 52.5±4.8a    | 45.0±9.6a    | 52.5±9.5ab | 62.5±8.5a          | 65.0±8.7a  |
| Bb-10                                    | 60.0±0.0a  | 52.5±2.5a    | 52.5±2.5a    | 47.5±4.8b  | 52.5±4.8a          | 60.0±0.0ab |
| Ma-11.1                                  | 50.0±7.1ab | 50.0±0.0a    | 45.0±6.5a    | 50.0±7.1ab | 50.0±4.1a          | 57.5±4.8ab |
| Ma-2.4                                   | 60.0±5.8a  | 50.0±0.0a    | 50.0±0.0a    | 57.5±4.8a  | 45.0±5.0a          | 50.0±0.0ab |
| If-03                                    | 57.5±2.5a  | 45.0±2.9a    | 40.0±4.1ab   | 62.5±7.5a  | 50.0±9.1a          | 75.5±4.8b  |
| If-02                                    | 62.5±2.5a  | 52.5±6.3a    | 52.5±2.5a    | 50.0±4.1ab | 55.0±6.5a          | 50.0±4.1b  |
| Control                                  | 2.5±2.5b   | 2.5±2.5b     | 2.5±2.5b     | 2.5±2.5c   | 2.5±2.5b           | 2.5±2.5c   |
| LSD                                      | 8.2        | 7.9          | 8.4          | 7.1        | 9.1                | 8.7        |
| F-value                                  | 23.4       | 15.2         | 19.8         | 16.2       | 10.1               | 21.8       |
| P-value                                  | 0.0        | 0.0          | 0.0          | 0.0        | 0.0                | 0.0        |
| <b>LC<sub>20</sub> + LC<sub>20</sub></b> |            |              |              |            |                    |            |
| Bb-01                                    | 57.5±4.8ba | 65.0±6.5a    | 55.0±2.9a    | 65.0±2.9a  | 67.5±2.5a          | 75.0±6.5a  |
| Bb-10                                    | 67.5±4.8a  | 60.0±0.0a    | 50.0±4.1ab   | 60.0±0.0a  | 62.5±2.5a          | 67.5±4.8ab |
| Ma-11.1                                  | 60.0±5.8a  | 60.0±4.1a    | 52.5±6.3ab   | 60.0±7.1a  | 57.5±2.5a          | 65.0±2.9ab |
| Ma-2.4                                   | 70.0±4.1a  | 55.0±2.9ab   | 62.5±6.3a    | 67.5±4.8a  | 57.5±6.3a          | 57.5±7.5ab |
| If-03                                    | 67.5±8.5a  | 52.5±4.8ab   | 50.0±4.1ab   | 70.0±7.1a  | 57.5±2.5a          | 70.0±8.2b  |
| If-02                                    | 70.0±5.8a  | 62.5±4.8a    | 57.5±4.8a    | 60.0±4.1a  | 67.5±4.8a          | 55.0±2.9b  |
| Control                                  | 2.5±2.5b   | 2.5±2.5b     | 2.5±2.5b     | 2.5±2.5b   | 2.5±2.5b           | 2.5±2.5c   |
| LSD                                      | 10.2       | 8.4          | 6.9          | 8.5        | 9.1                | 5.8        |
| F-value                                  | 22.8       | 15.8         | 18.2         | 22.4       | 38.8               | 20.2       |
| P-value                                  | 0.0        | 0.0          | 0.0          | 0.0        | 0.0                | 0.0        |
| <b>LC<sub>30</sub> + LC<sub>30</sub></b> |            |              |              |            |                    |            |
| Bb-01                                    | 67.5±7.5a  | 72.5±8.5a    | 62.5±10.3a   | 75.0±5.0a  | 77.5±7.5a          | 82.5±4.8a  |
| Bb-10                                    | 77.5±4.8a  | 70.0±7.1a    | 60.0±0.0a    | 70.0±4.1a  | 70.0±5.8a          | 77.5±4.8ab |
| Ma-11.1                                  | 72.5±2.5a  | 67.5±4.8a    | 65.0±5.0a    | 70.0±4.1a  | 67.5±2.5a          | 75.0±2.9ab |
| Ma-2.4                                   | 75.0±2.9a  | 62.5±4.8a    | 70.0±4.1a    | 77.5±6.3a  | 70.0±4.1a          | 67.5±8.5ab |
| If-03                                    | 75.0±2.9a  | 60.0±4.1a    | 60.0±4.1a    | 77.5±2.5a  | 65.0±5.0a          | 77.5±2.5b  |
| If-02                                    | 77.5±2.5a  | 67.5±4.8a    | 65.0±6.5a    | 70.0±5.8a  | 75.0±2.9a          | 65.0±6.5b  |
| Control                                  | 2.5±2.5b   | 2.5±2.5b     | 2.5±2.5b     | 2.5±2.5b   | 2.5±2.5b           | 2.5±2.5c   |
| LSD                                      | 8.2        | 9.4          | 7.8          | 10.3       | 7.9                | 8.8        |
| F-value                                  | 18.2       | 25.5         | 23.2         | 28.8       | 31.5               | 29.8       |
| P-value                                  | 0.0        | 0.0          | 0.0          | 0.0        | 0.0                | 0.0        |
| <b>LC<sub>40</sub> + LC<sub>40</sub></b> |            |              |              |            |                    |            |
| Bb-01                                    | 77.5±6.3a  | 80.0±7.1a    | 75.0±6.5a    | 87.5±6.3a  | 82.5±4.8a          | 90.0±4.1a  |
| Bb-10                                    | 90.0±4.1a  | 80.0±8.2a    | 72.5±4.8a    | 77.5±6.3a  | 80.0±4.1a          | 90.0±4.1a  |
| Ma-11.1                                  | 87.5±4.8a  | 77.5±4.8a    | 75.0±2.9a    | 80.0±4.1a  | 77.5±4.8a          | 82.5±7.5a  |
| Ma-2.4                                   | 85.0±2.9a  | 70.0±4.1a    | 77.5±2.5a    | 85.0±2.9a  | 80.0±4.1a          | 80.0±9.1a  |
| If-03                                    | 82.5±7.5a  | 70.0±4.1a    | 72.5±2.5a    | 85.0±6.5a  | 72.5±2.5a          | 82.5±2.5a  |
| If-02                                    | 82.5±4.8a  | 75.0±5.0a    | 77.5±2.5a    | 82.5±4.8a  | 80.0±0.0a          | 75.0±5.0a  |
| Control                                  | 2.5±2.5b   | 2.5±2.5b     | 2.5±2.5b     | 2.5±2.5b   | 2.5±2.5b           | 2.5±2.5b   |
| LSD                                      | 9.3        | 8.7          | 11.9         | 9.5        | 11.7               | 10.8       |
| F-value                                  | 43.4       | 35.8         | 48.3         | 35.8       | 64.2               | 32.0       |
| P-value                                  | 0.0        | 0.0          | 0.0          | 0.0        | 0.0                | 0.0        |

**Table III.- Nymphal duration of *O. hyalinipennis* after treatment of binary mixture of entomopathogenic fungi and insecticides.**

|  | Triazophos | Imidacloprid | Pyreproxifen | Nitenpyram | Lambda cyhalothrin | Bifenthrin |
|--|------------|--------------|--------------|------------|--------------------|------------|
| <b>LC<sub>10</sub> + LC<sub>10</sub></b> |            |              |              |            |                    |            |
| Bb-01                                    | 8.2±0.0a   | 9.1±0.5a     | 7.2±0.5a     | 7.8±0.5a   | 8.2±0.1a           | 7.8±0.9ab  |
| Bb-10                                    | 8.8±0.9a   | 7.1±0.5a     | 8.3±0.5a     | 8.1±0.1a   | 9.7±0.4a           | 8.6±0.9a   |
| Ma-11.1                                  | 7.1±0.7ab  | 9.9±0.4a     | 7.9±0.7a     | 8.8±0.4a   | 7.8±0.6a           | 8.5±0.7a   |
| Ma-2.4                                   | 7.6±0.2a   | 8.8±0.6b     | 6.8±0.8ab    | 9.9±0.5a   | 9.9±0.5a           | 9.7±0.5a   |
| If-03                                    | 9.3±0.4a   | 8.5±0.3a     | 8.9±0.9a     | 9.2±0.2a   | 7.1±0.6a           | 9.3±0.2a   |
| If-02                                    | 8.0±0.7a   | 8.0±0.7a     | 7.6±0.5a     | 7.7±1.0a   | 8.9±0.2a           | 8.9±0.1a   |
| Control                                  | 6.4±0.7ab  | 6.1±0.4ab    | 6.4±0.3ab    | 6.0±0.7ab  | 6.1±0.3ab          | 6.6±0.6b   |
| LSD                                      | 3.8        | 2.2          | 3.8          | 1.8        | 4.1                | 1.4        |
| F-value                                  | 3.6        | 4.8          | 4.0          | 3.9        | 4.8                | 3.2        |
| P-value                                  | 0.0        | 0.0          | 0.0          | 0.0        | 0.0                | 0.0        |
| <b>LC<sub>20</sub> + LC<sub>20</sub></b> |            |              |              |            |                    |            |
| Bb-01                                    | 11.3±0.3a  | 11.0±0.4a    | 9.9±0.5a     | 8.1±1.0b   | 9.3±0.9a           | 8.9±1.0ab  |
| Bb-10                                    | 8.9±0.7a   | 8.9±0.1ab    | 9.7±0.3a     | 9.2±0.3ab  | 11.5±0.7a          | 9.7±0.8ba  |
| Ma-11.1                                  | 9.0±0.4a   | 11.3±0.7a    | 10.1±0.5a    | 11.9±0.7a  | 9.4±0.9a           | 10.4±0.5a  |
| Ma-2.4                                   | 10.6±0.3a  | 9.5±0.5a     | 7.3±0.3ab    | 10.6±0.9a  | 10.0±0.5a          | 9.3±0.3a   |
| If-03                                    | 9.3±0.8a   | 9.1±0.5ab    | 8.6±0.9a     | 10.0±0.1ab | 9.9±0.4a           | 11.0±0.7a  |
| If-02                                    | 10.0±0.5a  | 10.6±0.9a    | 8.0±0.8ab    | 8.6±0.4b   | 8.3±0.5ab          | 10.0±0.6a  |
| Control                                  | 6.3±0.2b   | 5.3±0.8b     | 6.2±0.5b     | 6.1±0.9c   | 6.5±0.8b           | 7.0±0.4b   |
| LSD                                      | 2.2        | 0.9          | 2.8          | 1.5        | 2.1                | 2.0        |
| F-value                                  | 4.9        | 3.2          | 4.2          | 2.9        | 3.8                | 4.2        |
| P-value                                  | 0.0        | 0.0          | 0.0          | 0.0        | 0.0                | 0.0        |
| <b>LC<sub>30</sub> + LC<sub>30</sub></b> |            |              |              |            |                    |            |
| Bb-01                                    | 12.3±0.5a  | 11.0±0.4a    | 10.0±0.4a    | 10.9±0.7ab | 11.7±0.5a          | 11.9±1.0a  |
| Bb-10                                    | 10.1±0.9ab | 11.4±0.7a    | 9.0±0.9ab    | 13.8±0.9a  | 12.3±0.4a          | 9.8±0.5ab  |
| Ma-11.1                                  | 12.0±0.6a  | 12.7±0.8a    | 10.5±0.8a    | 12.8±0.7a  | 9.9±0.9ab          | 11.1±0.7a  |
| Ma-2.4                                   | 9.7±0.5ab  | 9.9±0.4ab    | 11.3±0.4a    | 13.1±0.8a  | 10.2±0.6a          | 11.0±0.9a  |
| If-03                                    | 10.9±1.0a  | 10.5±0.8a    | 9.0±0.2ab    | 12.4±0.4a  | 12.9±0.4a          | 10.6±0.4a  |
| If-02                                    | 11.9±0.6a  | 12.1±0.5a    | 12.6±0.3a    | 11.2±0.5a  | 12.1±0.4a          | 12.7±0.8a  |
| Control                                  | 5.9±0.5b   | 6.0±0.5b     | 6.5±0.3b     | 6.0±0.9b   | 5.5±0.4b           | 5.9±0.7b   |
| LSD                                      | 0.9        | 2.5          | 1.7          | 3.1        | 2.8                | 3.6        |
| F-value                                  | 3.2        | 3.0          | 3.8          | 4.2        | 3.9                | 4.0        |
| P-value                                  | 0.0        | 0.0          | 0.0          | 0.0        | 0.0                | 0.0        |
| <b>LC<sub>40</sub> + LC<sub>40</sub></b> |            |              |              |            |                    |            |
| Bb-01                                    | 14.2±0.3a  | 13.3±1.7a    | 11.0±1.8a    | 11.8±0.5ab | 12.8±0.7a          | 12.2±0.4ab |
| Bb-10                                    | 13.2±1.0a  | 12.7±0.3a    | 11.8±0.5a    | 12.2±0.3a  | 13.9±0.2a          | 12.0±0.5ab |
| Ma-11.1                                  | 11.9±1.9a  | 12.0±0.2a    | 12.1±0.2a    | 13.9±0.7a  | 12.1±0.9ab         | 12.6±0.9a  |
| Ma-2.4                                   | 13.7±1.4a  | 12.9±0.3a    | 13.7±0.6a    | 14.2±0.4a  | 15.0±0.4a          | 15.1±0.3a  |
| If-03                                    | 13.0±0.6a  | 11.2±0.4ab   | 12.8±0.3a    | 12.8±0.5a  | 12.9±0.8a          | 14.8±0.6a  |
| If-02                                    | 10.5±0.3ab | 12.3±0.6a    | 12.8±0.5a    | 13.2±0.6a  | 13.1±0.4a          | 13.8±1.0a  |
| Control                                  | 6.6±0.3b   | 6.9±0.5b     | 7.1±0.3b     | 6.6±0.6b   | 6.0±0.9b           | 6.3±0.5b   |
| LSD                                      | 1.4        | 3.5          | 3.4          | 1.9        | 4.2                | 1.0        |
| F-value                                  | 4.2        | 2.9          | 4.0          | 3.5        | 4.9                | 3.6        |
| P-value                                  | 0.0        | 0.0          | 0.0          | 0.0        | 0.0                | 0.0        |

**Table IV.- Percent adult emergence of *O. hyalinipennis* after treatment of binary mixture of entomopathogenic fungi and insecticides.**

|  | Triazophos | Imidacloprid | Pyreproxifen | Nitenpyram | Lambda cyhalothrin | Bifenthrin |
|--|------------|--------------|--------------|------------|--------------------|------------|
| <b>LC<sub>10</sub> + LC<sub>10</sub></b> |            |              |              |            |                    |            |
| Bb-01                                    | 50.0±2.5ab | 47.5±1.8b    | 55.0±5.3ab   | 47.6±3.7b  | 37.5±6.3b          | 35.0±3.1bc |
| Bb-10                                    | 50.0±3.3ab | 47.5±4.9b    | 60.0±5.9ab   | 52.5±5.8b  | 47.5±5.5b          | 40.0±3.5b  |
| Ma-11.1                                  | 50.0±5.3ab | 50.0±3.7b    | 55.0±4.9ab   | 50.0±1.9b  | 50.0±8.2b          | 42.5±4.8b  |
| Ma-2.4                                   | 40.0±2.3b  | 50.0±7.1b    | 50.0±3.5b    | 42.5±2.8b  | 55.0±4.9ab         | 50.0±2.5b  |
| If-03                                    | 42.5±5.6b  | 55.0±4.6ab   | 60.0±7.5ab   | 37.5±4.8b  | 50.0±3.9b          | 42.5±3.9b  |
| If-02                                    | 37.5±3.5b  | 47.5±5.6b    | 47.5±4.8b    | 50.0±4.5ab | 45.0±2.9c          | 50.0±4.6b  |
| Control                                  | 97.5±2.5a  | 97.5±2.5a    | 97.5±2.5a    | 97.5±2.5a  | 97.5±2.5a          | 97.5±2.5a  |
| LSD                                      | 20.3       | 27.8         | 25.0         | 32.1       | 29.5               | 26.4       |
| F-value                                  | 52.5       | 43.8         | 45.2         | 40.5       | 42.8               | 35.9       |
| P-value                                  | 0.0        | 0.0          | 0.0          | 0.0        | 0.0                | 0.0        |
| <b>LC<sub>20</sub> + LC<sub>20</sub></b> |            |              |              |            |                    |            |
| Bb-01                                    | 42.5±3.3ab | 35.0±5.3b    | 45.0±2.3ab   | 35.0±5.2b  | 32.5±7.1b          | 25.0±2.8b  |
| Bb-10                                    | 37.5±5.8ab | 40.0±3.6b    | 50.0±4.9a    | 40.0±1.9b  | 37.5±7.5b          | 32.5±5.4b  |
| Ma-11.1                                  | 40.0±4.9ab | 40.0±2.9b    | 47.5±1.9ab   | 40.0±2.5b  | 42.5±4.9b          | 35.0±3.8b  |
| Ma-2.4                                   | 30.0±2.7b  | 45.0±4.8ab   | 37.5±2.8ab   | 32.5±4.5b  | 42.5±5.3b          | 42.5±2.5b  |
| If-03                                    | 32.5±4.5b  | 47.5±3.9ab   | 50.0±3.2a    | 30.0±2.5bc | 42.5±3.5b          | 30.0±3.9b  |
| If-02                                    | 30.0±5.4b  | 37.5±5.2b    | 42.5±4.8ab   | 40.0±3.6b  | 32.5±2.9b          | 45.0±4.2ab |
| Control                                  | 97.5±2.5a  | 97.5±2.5a    | 97.5±2.5a    | 97.5±2.5a  | 97.5±2.5a          | 97.5±2.5a  |
| LSD                                      | 33.5       | 32.8         | 29.6         | 35.2       | 30.4               | 28.5       |
| F-value                                  | 65.0       | 55.5         | 60.8         | 40.6       | 45.8               | 50.0       |
| P-value                                  | 0.0        | 0.0          | 0.0          | 0.0        | 0.0                | 0.0        |
| <b>LC<sub>30</sub> + LC<sub>30</sub></b> |            |              |              |            |                    |            |
| Bb-01                                    | 32.5±5.0ab | 27.5±2.6b    | 37.5±7.1ab   | 25.0±5.7b  | 22.5±4.8b          | 17.5±5.7b  |
| Bb-10                                    | 27.5±3.8b  | 30.0±7.5b    | 40.0±6.8ab   | 30.0±5.4b  | 30.0±4.3b          | 22.5±4.3b  |
| Ma-11.1                                  | 27.5±5.5b  | 32.5±4.7b    | 35.0±5.6ab   | 30.0±4.8b  | 32.5±6.7ab         | 25.0±3.7b  |
| Ma-2.4                                   | 25.0±2.4b  | 37.5±6.5b    | 30.0±2.9b    | 23.5±5.3b  | 30.0±4.9b          | 32.5±3.3b  |
| If-03                                    | 25.0±3.7b  | 40.0±7.6ab   | 40.0±3.4ab   | 22.5±3.9b  | 35.0±2.6ab         | 22.5±2.3b  |
| If-02                                    | 22.5±4.6b  | 32.5±8.5b    | 35.0±4.5ab   | 30.0±4.7b  | 25.0±3.3b          | 35.0±5.5b  |
| Control                                  | 97.5±2.5a  | 97.5±2.5a    | 97.5±2.5a    | 97.5±2.5a  | 97.5±2.5a          | 97.5±2.5a  |
| LSD                                      | 18.7       | 22.3         | 19.5         | 15.8       | 20.5               | 23.4       |
| F-value                                  | 64.1       | 58.0         | 65.6         | 60.0       | 66.2               | 60.7       |
| P-value                                  | 0.0        | 0.0          | 0.0          | 0.0        | 0.0                | 0.0        |
| <b>LC<sub>40</sub> + LC<sub>40</sub></b> |            |              |              |            |                    |            |
| Bb-01                                    | 22.5±4.6b  | 20.0±3.3bc   | 25.0±3.3b    | 12.5±2.9c  | 17.5±5.2b          | 10.0±2.6bc |
| Bb-10                                    | 17.5±2.7bc | 20.0±2.5bc   | 27.5±6.6b    | 22.5±3.5bc | 20.0±4.8b          | 10.0±1.8bc |
| Ma-11.1                                  | 12.5±2.0bc | 22.5±4.5b    | 25.0±5.7b    | 20.0±4.9bc | 22.5±2.6b          | 17.5±4.6b  |
| Ma-2.4                                   | 15.0±1.6bc | 30.0±5.9b    | 22.5±3.4b    | 15.0±4.5c  | 20.0±5.6b          | 20.0±3.8b  |
| If-03                                    | 17.5±3.6bc | 30.0±4.9b    | 27.5±5.5b    | 15.0±3.5c  | 27.5±3.6b          | 17.5±5.6b  |
| If-02                                    | 17.5±4.9bc | 25.0±5.3b    | 22.5±4.3b    | 17.5±3.3bc | 20.0±3.8b          | 25.0±4.9b  |
| Control                                  | 97.5±2.5a  | 97.5±2.5a    | 97.5±2.5a    | 97.5±2.5a  | 97.5±2.5a          | 97.5±2.5a  |
| LSD                                      | 34.2       | 28.8         | 19.7         | 30.2       | 27.4               | 22.8       |
| F-value                                  | 47.7       | 55.4         | 50.6         | 40.5       | 49.7               | 56.4       |
| P-value                                  | 0.0        | 0.0          | 0.0          | 0.0        | 0.0                | 0.0        |

**Table V.- Male longevity of *O. hyalinipennis* after treatment of binary mixture of entomopathogenic fungi and insecticides.**

|  | Triazophos | Imidacloprid | Pyreproxifen | Nitenpyram | Lambda cyhalothrin | Bifenthrin |
|--|------------|--------------|--------------|------------|--------------------|------------|
| <b>LC<sub>10</sub> + LC<sub>10</sub></b> |            |              |              |            |                    |            |
| Bb-01                                    | 9.8±0.9ab  | 9.9±0.3ab    | 9.1±0.5ab    | 9.0±0.3a   | 8.4±1.0b           | 8.8±0.4ab  |
| Bb-10                                    | 9.0±0.3b   | 9.1±0.2ab    | 9.8±0.8ab    | 9.2±0.5a   | 9.1±0.4ab          | 7.8±0.4b   |
| Ma-11.1                                  | 8.8±0.2b   | 8.1±0.4b     | 8.4±0.8b     | 8.6±0.9ab  | 8.6±0.4ab          | 8.1±0.8b   |
| Ma-2.4                                   | 8.2±0.8b   | 8.8±0.8ab    | 9.5±0.7ab    | 9.0±0.5a   | 8.0±0.3b           | 7.1±0.4b   |
| If-03                                    | 10.0±0.8a  | 9.9±0.6ab    | 8.9±0.8b     | 8.2±0.8ab  | 9.5±0.5ab          | 9.7±0.5a   |
| If-02                                    | 9.2±0.4ab  | 9.4±0.4ab    | 10.2±0.6b    | 9.7±0.7b   | 10.0±0.7ab         | 10.0±0.8a  |
| Control                                  | 11.2±0.3a  | 12.5±0.7a    | 11.6±0.5a    | 11.0±0.9a  | 12.7±0.6a          | 12.5±0.5a  |
| LSD                                      | 0.9        | 1.9          | 1.5          | 2.7        | 1.4                | 2.9        |
| F-value                                  | 2.1        | 3.8          | 2.6          | 3.2        | 4.2                | 3.8        |
| P-value                                  | 0.0        | 0.0          | 0.0          | 0.0        | 0.0                | 0.0        |
| <b>LC<sub>20</sub> + LC<sub>20</sub></b> |            |              |              |            |                    |            |
| Bb-01                                    | 8.1±0.5a   | 9.0±0.9ab    | 7.2±0.4b     | 7.1±0.7b   | 8.2±0.8ab          | 8.0±0.ab   |
| Bb-10                                    | 7.2±0.4ab  | 8.6±1.0b     | 8.2±0.6b     | 7.0±0.8b   | 7.0±0.3b           | 6.4±0.5b   |
| Ma-11.1                                  | 7.8±0.7ab  | 6.3±0.4c     | 7.3±0.5b     | 7.6±0.3b   | 7.2±0.7b           | 7.1±0.7b   |
| Ma-2.4                                   | 6.1±0.3b   | 6.0±0.7c     | 6.0±1.0bc    | 6.2±0.5b   | 6.0±0.5b           | 6.6±0.6b   |
| If-03                                    | 7.5±0.8ab  | 6.8±0.9bc    | 7.7±0.7b     | 8.1±0.6ab  | 7.9±0.2ab          | 8.7±0.4ab  |
| If-02                                    | 6.9±0.7ab  | 7.1±0.8b     | 7.0±0.3b     | 6.9±0.7b   | 7.0±0.7b           | 7.8±0.6ab  |
| Control                                  | 10.6±0.9a  | 11.3±0.7a    | 12.0±0.7a    | 11.7±0.7a  | 10.8±0.6a          | 11.5±0.3a  |
| LSD                                      | 1.6        | 0.8          | 2.5          | 1.2        | 2.1                | 1.9        |
| F-value                                  | 3.8        | 2.4          | 3.8          | 4.1        | 3.4                | 4.2        |
| P-value                                  | 0.0        | 0.0          | 0.0          | 0.0        | 0.0                | 0.0        |
| <b>LC<sub>30</sub> + LC<sub>30</sub></b> |            |              |              |            |                    |            |
| Bb-01                                    | 4.9±0.5b   | 6.8±0.4b     | 6.9±0.7b     | 5.4±0.8b   | 6.0±0.3bc          | 6.2±0.5b   |
| Bb-10                                    | 4.1±0.4bc  | 5.7±0.9bc    | 5.1±0.5bc    | 4.9±0.4b   | 5.1±0.8c           | 4.7±0.8b   |
| Ma-11.1                                  | 4.5±0.8b   | 5.2±0.6c     | 5.6±0.9b     | 5.8±0.6b   | 5.7±1.0bc          | 5.1±0.6b   |
| Ma-2.4                                   | 4.0±0.3bc  | 4.2±0.2c     | 4.8±0.7bc    | 4.0±0.5bc  | 4.3±0.2c           | 4.1±0.5b   |
| If-03                                    | 6.4±0.5ab  | 5.8±0.7bc    | 6.1±0.6b     | 5.1±0.9b   | 5.9±0.6bc          | 4.9±0.5b   |
| If-02                                    | 5.3±0.8b   | 6.2±0.9bc    | 5.5±0.3b     | 4.6±1.0b   | 4.9±0.8c           | 5.9±0.8b   |
| Control                                  | 10.6±0.7a  | 12.9±0.6a    | 12.3±0.3a    | 11.6±0.4a  | 13.5±0.2a          | 12.1±0.5a  |
| LSD                                      | 2.0        | 1.7          | 3.2          | 2.5        | 2.9                | 4.0        |
| F-value                                  | 4.3        | 3.7          | 5.0          | 4.8        | 4.2                | 5.5        |
| P-value                                  | 0.0        | 0.0          | 0.0          | 0.0        | 0.0                | 0.0        |
| <b>LC<sub>40</sub> + LC<sub>40</sub></b> |            |              |              |            |                    |            |
| Bb-01                                    | 4.3±0.5b   | 4.5±0.5b     | 4.9±0.7b     | 4.1±0.6bc  | 5.8±0.7ab          | 5.9±0.7b   |
| Bb-10                                    | 3.6±0.7b   | 4.6±0.4b     | 4.3±0.9b     | 3.7±0.1bc  | 5.0±0.5b           | 4.2±0.7b   |
| Ma-11.1                                  | 4.0±0.3b   | 3.8±0.4b     | 5.1±0.6b     | 5.0±0.2b   | 5.5±0.8ab          | 5.5±0.8b   |
| Ma-2.4                                   | 3.0±0.5bc  | 2.9±0.4bc    | 3.9±0.5bc    | 3.2±0.4bc  | 4.0±0.4b           | 5.0±0.3b   |
| If-03                                    | 4.3±0.6b   | 4.9±0.5b     | 5.6±0.4b     | 4.7±0.6b   | 5.3±0.7ab          | 6.2±0.5b   |
| If-02                                    | 5.0±0.4b   | 4.3±0.6bc    | 4.6±0.6b     | 4.1±1.0bc  | 4.3±0.5b           | 5.2±0.4b   |
| Control                                  | 10.5±0.8a  | 12.3±0.6a    | 12.1±0.8a    | 12.6±0.5a  | 11.2±0.7a          | 11.5±0.3a  |
| LSD                                      | 3.5        | 2.8          | 4.1          | 3.6        | 2.2                | 5.9        |
| F-value                                  | 4.8        | 5.2          | 5.8          | 5.0        | 6.1                | 5.2        |
| P-value                                  | 0.0        | 0.0          | 0.0          | 0.0        | 0.0                | 0.0        |

### *Nymphal duration*

The binary treatment of fungi and insecticides significantly prolonged nymphal duration in all treatments. The maximum prolongation of nymphal duration (days) ( $15.1 \pm 0.3$ ) was observed in treatment with Ma-2.4 and bifenthrin ( $LC_{40}$ ). In case of  $LC_{30}$ , nymphal duration ( $13.1 \pm 0.8$ ) days was recorded in treatment with  $LC_{30}$  of Ma-2.4 and nitenpyram. On the other hand, the nymphal duration of  $11.8 \pm 0.6$  days was observed in the treatment of combined mixture of Ma-11.1 ( $LC_{20}$ ) and nitenpyram ( $LC_{20}$ ), while  $9.9 \pm 0.4$  days were recorded by the treatment of combined mixture of  $LC_{10}$  of Ma-2.4 and lambda cyhalothrin (Table III).

### *Adult emergence*

High doses of fungi and insecticides mixture decreased the adult percent emergence to a greater extent, while significant decrease was also recorded in other doses. The highest percent emergence *i.e.*,  $30.0 \pm 5.8$  and  $30.0 \pm 4.9$  after application of  $LC_{40}$  of Ma-2.4 + imidacloprid and  $LC_{40}$  of If-03 + imidacloprid was recorded, respectively. While the lowest percent emergence *i.e.*,  $10.0 \pm 2.5$  and  $10.0 \pm 1.8$  with the mixture of  $LC_{40}$  of Bb-01 and bifenthrin and Bb-10 and bifenthrin, respectively. In case of  $LC_{30}$  lowest adult emergence ( $17.5 \pm 5.6$ ) was observed in the mixture of  $LC_{30}$  of Bb-01 and bifenthrin. While for  $LC_{20}$  and  $LC_{10}$  lowest adult emergence *i.e.*,  $25.0 \pm 2.7$  and  $35.0 \pm 3.1$  were recorded, respectively in combination with Bb-01 and bifenthrin (Table IV).

### *Adult longevity*

The combinations of fungi and insecticides greatly shortened the male longevity. At  $LC_{40}$  and  $LC_{20}$  of Ma-2.4 and imidacloprid reduced the male longevity to  $2.8 \pm 0.3$  and  $5.9 \pm 0.7$  days, respectively. The minimal male longevity,  $3.9 \pm 0.3$  days was observed in combination of  $LC_{30}$  of Ma-2.4 and triazophos, while at  $LC_{10}$  the minimum male longevity  $7.1 \pm 0.4$  days was recorded in combination of  $LC_{10}$  of Ma-2.4 and bifenthrin mixture (Table V).

The combined treatments of fungi and insecticides greatly affected the female longevity of *O. hyalinipennis*. The results showed that the combined mixture of Ma-2.4 and bifenthrin at  $LC_{40}$ ,  $LC_{30}$  and  $LC_{20}$  reduced female longevity to  $3.1 \pm 0.8$ ,  $5.0 \pm 0.7$  and  $10.0 \pm 0.9$  days, respectively. While the mixture of  $LC_{10}$  of Ma-2.4 and triazophos reduced female longevity to  $12.6 \pm 0.8$  days.

## DISCUSSION

There is a great interest all over the world for utilizing and manipulating entomopathogenic fungi for

biological control of insects. Entomopathogenic fungi are just like parasite which kill or disable the insects. Unlike other pathogens like bacteria and viruses which need to be ingested for their action these fungi require contact with cuticle under favorable temperature and humidity (Dhaliwal and Koul, 2007). In order to increase their effectiveness, these can be mixed with insecticides (Pachamuthu and Kamble, 2000). These fungi and selective insecticides may synergize the effect of each other thus increasing the efficiency of control, preservation of natural enemies, reducing insecticides usage, environmental risks and resistance in pests (Quintela and McCoy, 1998; Dayakar *et al.*, 2000; Ambethgar, 2003; Rachapa *et al.*, 2007). Combination of imidacloprid and fungal pathogen showed the synergistic effect for the control of insect pests (Kaakeh *et al.*, 1997; Quintela and McCoy, 1998; Ramakrishnan *et al.*, 1999; Lacey *et al.*, 1999; Ying *et al.*, 2003).

The findings of current study depicted that the binary mixtures of fungi and insecticides at higher doses showed higher mortality than alone application. Highest percent mortality *i.e.*, 90.0 was caused by the mixture of isolate Bb-01 and bifenthrin. It confirms the findings of Purwar and Sachan (2006) that the mixture *B. bassiana* and endosulfan proved to be more toxic and caused higher mortality in *Spilarctia oblique* (Walker). Identical results were reported by Dayakar *et al.* (2000) when combined mixture of *B. bassiana* and insecticide was applied to *Spodoptera litura* (Fabricius). *B. bassiana* is highly compatible with avermectin and pyrethroids than any other insecticide (De Olivera and Neves, 2004). Synergistic effect of *B. bassiana* and imidacloprid, *M. anisopliae* and fenitrothion or teflubenzuron were recorded against termite *Reticulitermes flavipes* (Kollar) and scarab beetle larvae (Boucias *et al.*, 1996; Hornbostel *et al.*, 2005). Previous studies focused on the potential use of combination of insecticides and fungi (Pachamuthu and Kamble, 2000; Zurek *et al.*, 2002; Jaramillo *et al.*, 2005; Thompson *et al.*, 2006; Ericsson *et al.*, 2007; Sharifard *et al.*, 2011). In addition to the direct effect on insect mortality, the current study also studied the effects on the biological parameters including adult emergence and adult longevity. Binary mixture of entomopathogenic fungi and insecticides greatly reduced the percent adult emergence and adult longevity at higher doses while on other doses there was significant difference in the percent adult emergence and adult longevity than normal which is in accordance to study of Ekesi *et al.* (2002) which showed low adult emergence in *S. litura* when treated with fungus. The results of current research are in accordance to the findings of Pelizza *et al.* (2013), who validated the decrease in

the survival rate and lower fecundity in dipterans when treated with the EPF. The present research shows that the mixture of pathogenic fungi and insecticides increased the

management; however, more work is needed to study the compatibility of these fungi and insecticides under field conditions.

**Table VI.- Female longevity of *O. hyalinipennis* after the treatment of binary mixture of entomopathogenic fungi and insecticides.**

|  | Triazophos | Imidacloprid | Pyreproxifen | Nitenpyram | Lambda cyhalothrin | Bifenthrin |
|--|------------|--------------|--------------|------------|--------------------|------------|
| <b>LC<sub>10</sub> + LC<sub>10</sub></b> |            |              |              |            |                    |            |
| Bb-01                                    | 12.9±0.4a  | 14.3±0.5a    | 14.3±0.8a    | 14.1±0.6a  | 13.9±0.4a          | 14.1±0.2a  |
| Bb-10                                    | 13.3±0.6a  | 13.4±0.3a    | 13.6±0.3a    | 14.7±0.8a  | 14.5±0.8a          | 14.7±1.0a  |
| Ma-11.1                                  | 13.9±1.2a  | 12.8±0.8ab   | 13.0±0.7ab   | 13.9±0.8a  | 13.7±0.8a          | 13.5±0.8a  |
| Ma-2.4                                   | 12.6±0.8a  | 13.0±0.6ab   | 12.8±0.8b    | 12.3±0.7ab | 13.0±0.7ab         | 12.8±0.6ab |
| If-03                                    | 14.2±0.6a  | 14.4±1.0a    | 14.0±0.8a    | 14.3±0.6a  | 15.0±0.7a          | 14.9±0.5a  |
| If-02                                    | 13.0±0.4a  | 14.0±0.7ba   | 13.0±0.5ab   | 13.5±0.3a  | 14.0±0.2a          | 13.9±0.7a  |
| Control                                  | 14.9±1.2a  | 15.3±1.7a    | 15.3±1.0a    | 15.1±0.4a  | 15.2±1.0a          | 15.3±0.3a  |
| LSD                                      | 0.8        | 2.6          | 8.1          | 12.5       | 7.4                | 10.8       |
| F-value                                  | 5.6        | 3.2          | 2.5          | 4.3        | 2.8                | 3.1        |
| P-value                                  | 0.0        | 0.0          | 0.0          | 0.0        | 0.0                | 0.0        |
| <b>LC<sub>20</sub> + LC<sub>20</sub></b> |            |              |              |            |                    |            |
| Bb-01                                    | 12.2±0.4b  | 12.2±0.9a    | 13.2±0.7a    | 13.4±0.5a  | 12.2±0.8a          | 12.5±0.5a  |
| Bb-10                                    | 13.2±0.7a  | 12.0±0.7a    | 12.8±0.7a    | 12.7±0.5a  | 12.0±0.7a          | 12.0±0.6a  |
| Ma-11.1                                  | 13.0±0.3ab | 12.9±0.3a    | 13.0±0.6a    | 12.2±0.7ab | 11.0±0.5ab         | 11.2±0.1ab |
| Ma-2.4                                   | 11.5±0.6b  | 11.7±0.6ab   | 11.6±0.8ab   | 11.5±0.7b  | 10.6±0.9ab         | 10.0±1.0b  |
| If-03                                    | 13.8±0.5a  | 13.2±0.6a    | 12.2±0.3a    | 13.1±0.9a  | 12.9±0.5a          | 11.9±0.4a  |
| If-02                                    | 12.1±0.9b  | 12.6±0.3a    | 12.0±0.8a    | 12.3±0.9ab | 11.6±0.7ab         | 12.8±0.7a  |
| Control                                  | 15.1±0.3a  | 14.9±0.4a    | 14.7±0.7a    | 15.5±0.3a  | 14.2±0.9a          | 14.9±0.4a  |
| LSD                                      | 3.5        | 5.1          | 3.0          | 6.3        | 12.1               | 10.3       |
| F-value                                  | 2.8        | 4.7          | 4.6          | 5.2        | 3.9                | 4.1        |
| P-value                                  | 0.0        | 0.0          | 0.0          | 0.0        | 0.0                | 0.0        |
| <b>LC<sub>30</sub> + LC<sub>30</sub></b> |            |              |              |            |                    |            |
| Bb-01                                    | 8.0±0.4b   | 8.2±0.5b     | 8.7±0.6b     | 8.1±0.8b   | 8.8±0.7b           | 8.0±0.9b   |
| Bb-10                                    | 6.4±0.6c   | 7.1±0.3bc    | 8.0±0.7bc    | 7.2±0.3b   | 7.8±0.4b           | 7.3±0.2b   |
| Ma-11.1                                  | 7.1±0.4b   | 7.9±0.5b     | 8.1±0.5b     | 7.7±0.8b   | 7.5±0.5bc          | 7.8±0.4b   |
| Ma-2.4                                   | 5.9±0.1bc  | 6.8±0.3bc    | 7.7±0.5bc    | 6.0±1.0bc  | 6.1±0.9bc          | 5.0±0.7bc  |
| If-03                                    | 8.2±0.8b   | 8.3±0.8b     | 8.4±0.4b     | 8.7±0.4b   | 8.4±0.3b           | 7.4±0.3b   |
| If-02                                    | 7.6±0.7b   | 7.5±0.2b     | 7.5±0.8c     | 8.0±0.3b   | 7.0±0.5bc          | 6.3±0.7bc  |
| Control                                  | 14.3±0.5a  | 14.8±0.8a    | 15.1±0.5a    | 15.2±0.4a  | 14.4±0.4a          | 15.1±0.5a  |
| LSD                                      | 7.5        | 12.0         | 21.4         | 15.3       | 14.5               | 17.1       |
| F-value                                  | 5.2        | 4.7          | 3.9          | 6.0        | 4.7                | 5.8        |
| P-value                                  | 0.0        | 0.0          | 0.0          | 0.0        | 0.0                | 0.0        |
| <b>LC<sub>40</sub> + LC<sub>40</sub></b> |            |              |              |            |                    |            |
| Bb-01                                    | 5.1±1.0b   | 4.9±0.5b     | 5.0±0.9b     | 4.9±0.9b   | 5.0±0.6b           | 5.4±0.1b   |
| Bb-10                                    | 4.1±0.8b   | 4.3±0.6bc    | 4.6±0.5b     | 3.9±0.7bc  | 3.6±0.5b           | 3.5±0.8bc  |
| Ma-11.1                                  | 4.5±0.3b   | 4.2±1.0bc    | 4.4±0.6b     | 4.4±0.8b   | 4.5±0.4b           | 4.6±1.0b   |
| Ma-2.4                                   | 3.8±0.8bc  | 3.7±0.1c     | 4.0±0.8bc    | 3.2±0.5bc  | 3.9±0.4b           | 3.1±0.8bc  |
| If-03                                    | 5.4±0.9b   | 5.2±0.5bc    | 5.3±0.2b     | 4.8±0.4b   | 4.1±0.4b           | 4.0±0.4b   |
| If-02                                    | 4.9±0.1b   | 4.0±0.2bc    | 4.1±0.3bc    | 3.7±0.5bc  | 3.3±0.9bc          | 3.8±0.7bc  |
| Control                                  | 15.1±0.5a  | 14.3±0.9a    | 15.1±0.3a    | 14.2±0.2a  | 14.6±0.8a          | 15.3±0.1a  |
| LSD                                      | 12.4       | 9.8          | 13.5         | 10.6       | 15.3               | 23.0       |
| F-value                                  | 7.3        | 5.7          | 8.2          | 6.9        | 9.0                | 8.6        |
| P-value                                  | 0.0        | 0.0          | 0.0          | 0.0        | 0.0                | 0.0        |

## CONCLUSION

The present research shows that the mixture of pathogenic fungi and insecticides increased the management by increasing mortality and decreasing the development time of different stages of *O. hyalinipennis*; however, more work is needed to study the compatibility of these fungi and insecticides under field conditions.

### Statement of conflict of interest

The authors declare no conflict of interest.

## REFERENCES

- Akram, M., Asi, M.R., Haq, M., Afzal M. and Saleem, M.S., 2013. Bioefficacy of organophosphates, pyrethroids and new chemistry insecticides against a field population of dusky cotton bug, *Oxycarenus* spp. (Hemiptera: Oxycarenidae) in Bt cotton ecosystem. *Pakistan J. Life Soc. Sci.*, **11**: 48-52.
- Ambethgar, V., 2003. *Investigations on the development of mycoinsecticide formulations of an indigenous isolate of Beauveria bassiana (Bals.) Vull. For the management of rice leaf folder, Cnaphalocrocis medinalis Guenee*. Ph.D. thesis, Tamil Nadu Agricultural University, Coimbatore, pp. 270.
- Anand, R., Prasad, B. and Tiwary, B.N., 2008. Relative susceptibility of *Spodoptera litura* pupae to selected entomopathogenic fungi. *BioControl*, **54**: 85-92. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10526-008-9157-x>
- Anand, R. and Tiwary, B.N., 2009. Pathogenicity of entomopathogenic fungi to eggs and larvae of *Spodoptera litura*, the common cutworm. *Biocontr. Sci. Technol.*, **19**: 919-929. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09583150903205069>
- Aslam, M., Razaq, M., Saeed, N.A. and Ahmad, F., 2004. Comparative resistance of different cotton varieties against bollworm complex. *Int. J. Agric. Biol.*, **6**: 39-41.
- Boucias, D.G., Stokes, C., Storey, G. and Pendland, J.C., 1996. The effects of imidacloprid on the termite *Reticulitermes flavipes* and its interaction with the mycopathogen *Beauveria bassiana*. *Pflanzenschutz-Nachr. Bayer.*, **49**: 103-144.
- Carruthers, R.I. and Hural, K., 1990. Fungi as naturally occurring entomopathogens. *UCLA Symp. Mol. Cell. Biol. USA*, **112**: 115-138.
- Dayakar, S., Kanaujia, K.R. and Rathore, R.R.S., 2000. Compatibility of entomogenous fungi with commonly used insecticides for the management of *Spodoptera litura* (Fab.). In: *Microbials in insect pest management* (eds. S. Ignacimuthu and A. Sen). Oxford and IBH Publishing, New Delhi, India, pp. 47-52.
- De Olivera, R.C. and Neves, P.M.O.J., 2004. Biological control compatibility of *Beauveria bassiana* with acaricides. *Neotrop. Ent.*, **33**: 353-358. <https://doi.org/10.1590/S1519-566X2004000300013>
- Dhaliwal, G.S. and Koul, O., 2007. *Fungal pathogens in biopesticides and pest management*. Kalyani Publishers, New Delhi, India.
- Ekesi, S., Maniania, N.K. and Lux, S.A., 2002. Mortality in three African tephritid fly puparia and pupa caused by entomopathogenic fungi, *Metarhizium anisopliae* and *Beauveria bassiana*. *Biocontr. Sci. Technol.*, **12**: 7-17. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09583150120093077>
- Ericsson, J.D., Kabaluk, J.T., Goettel, M.S. and Myers, J.H., 2007. Spinosad interacts synergistically with the insect pathogen *Metarhizium anisopliae* against the exotic wireworm *Agriotes lineatus* and *Agriotes obscurus* (Coleoptera: Elatridae). *J. econ. Ent.*, **100**: 31-38. <https://doi.org/10.1093/jee/100.1.31>
- Farooq, O., 2014. Agriculture-17. In: *Pakistan Economic Survey 2012-13* (ed. S.E. Wasti). Published by Ministry of Finance, Govt. of Pakistan.
- Freed, S., Liang, J.F., Naem, M., Xiang, R.S. and Hussian, M., 2012. Toxicity of proteins secreted by entomopathogenic fungi against *Plutella xylostella* (Lepidoptera: Plutellidae). *Int. J. Agric. Biol.*, **14**: 291-295.
- Hiromori, H. and Nishigaki, J., 2001. Factor analysis of synergistic effect between the entomopathogenic fungus and synthetic insecticides. *Appl. Ent. Zool.*, **36**: 231-236. <https://doi.org/10.1303/aez.2001.231>
- Hornbostel, V.L., Zhioua, E., Benjamin, M.A., Ginsberg, H.S. and Ostfeldt, R.S., 2005. Pathogenicity of *Metarhizium anisopliae* (Deuteromycetes) and permethrin to *Ixodes scapularis* (Acari: Ixodidae) nymphs. *Exp. appl. Acarol.*, **35**: 301-316. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10493-004-5437-z>
- Jaramillo, J., Borgemeister, C., Ebssa, L., Gaigl, A., Tobon, R. and Zimmermann, G., 2005. Effect of combined application of *Metarhizium anisopliae* (Deuteromycotina: Hyphomycetes) strain CIAT 224 and different dosages of imidacloprid on the subterranean burrower bug *Cyrtomenus bergi* Froeschner (Hemiptera: Cydnidae). *Biol. Contr.*, **34**: 12-20. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.biocontrol.2005.03.021>
- Kaakeh, W., Reid, B.L., Bonhert, T.J. and Bennett, G.W., 1997. Toxicity of imidacloprid in the German cockroach (Dictyoptera: Blattellidae), and the

- synergism between imidacloprid and *Metarhizium anisopliae* (Imperfect fungi: Hyphomycetes). *J. econ. Ent.*, **90**: 473-482. <https://doi.org/10.1093/jee/90.2.473>
- Lacey, L.A., Frutos, R., Kaya, H.K. and Vails, P., 2001. Insect pathogens as biological control agents: Do they have future? *Biol. Contr.*, **21**: 230-248. <https://doi.org/10.1006/bcon.2001.0938>
- Lacey, L.A., Horton, D.R., Chauvin, R.L. and Stocker, J.M., 1999. Comparative efficacy of *Beauveria bassiana*, *Bacillus thuringiensis* and aldicarb for control of Colorado potato beetle in an irrigated desert agro ecosystem and their effects on biodiversity. *Ent. Exp. Appl.*, **93**: 189-200. <https://doi.org/10.1046/j.1570-7458.1999.00578.x>
- LeOra Software, 2003. *A User's Guide to Probit and Logit Analysis*. LeOra Software, Berkeley, CA, USA.
- Moino, J.R. and Alves, S.B., 1998. Efeito de imidacloprid e fipronil sobre *Beauveria bassiana* (Bals.) Vuill. *Metarhizium anisopliae* (Metsch.) Sorok. No comportamento de limpeza de *Heterotermes tenuis* (Hagen). *Anns. Soc. Ent. Brasil.*, **27**: 611-619. <https://doi.org/10.1590/S0301-80591998000400014>
- Nguyen, N., Borgemeister, C., Poehling, H. and Zimmermann, G., 2007. Laboratory investigations on the potential of entomopathogenic fungi for biocontrol of *Helicoverpa armigera* (Lepidoptera: Noctuidae) larvae and pupae. *Biocontr. Sci. Technol.*, **17**: 853-864. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09583150701546375>
- Pachamuthu, P. and Kamble, S.T., 2000. *In vivo* study on combined toxicity of *Metarhizium anisopliae* (Deuteromycotina: Hyphomycetes) strain ESC-1 sublethal doses of chlorpyrifos, propetamphos, and cyfluthrin against German cockroach (Dictyoptera: Blattellidae). *J. econ. Ent.*, **93**: 60-70. <https://doi.org/10.1603/0022-0493-93.1.60>
- Patil, B.V. and Rajanikanth, R., 2005. Dusky cotton bug, a future threat for Bt cotton cultivation. *Insect Environ.*, **11**: 77-79.
- Pelizza, S.A., Scorsetti, A.C. and Tranchida, M.C., 2013. The sublethal effects of the entomopathic fungus *Leptolegnia chapmanii* on some biological parameters of the dengue vector *Aedes aegypti*. *J. Insect Sci.*, **13**: 1-8. <https://doi.org/10.1673/031.013.2201>
- Prayogo, Y., Tengkan, W. and Marwoto, D., 2005. Prospect of entomopathogenic fungus *Metarhizium anisopliae* to control *Spodoptera litura* on soybean. *J. Litbang Pertanian.*, **24**: 19-26.
- Purwar, J.P. and Sachan, G.C., 2006. Synergistic effect of entomogenous fungi on some insecticides against Bihar hairy caterpillar, *Spilarctia oblique* (Lepidoptera: Arctiidae). *Microbiol. Res.*, **161**: 38-42. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.micres.2005.04.006>
- Quintela, E.D. and McCoy, C.W., 1998. Synergistic effect of imidacloprid and two entomogenous fungi on behaviour and survival of *Diaprepes abbreviatus* (Coleoptera: Curculionidae) in soil. *J. econ. Ent.*, **91**: 110-122. <https://doi.org/10.1093/jee/91.1.110>
- Rachappa, V., Lingappa, S. and Patil, R.K., 2007. Effect of agrochemicals on growth and sporulation of *Metarhizium anisopliae* (Metschnikoff) Sorokin. *Karnataka J. agric. Sci.*, **20**: 410-413.
- Ramakrishnan, R., Suiter, D.R., Nakatsu, C.H., Humber, R.A. and Bennett, G.W., 1999. Imidacloprid enhanced *Reticulitermes flavipes* (Isoptera Rhinotermitidae) susceptibility to the entomopathogen, *Metarhizium anisopliae*. *J. econ. Ent.*, **92**: 1125-1132. <https://doi.org/10.1093/jee/92.5.1125>
- Sammaiah, C., Laxman, P. and Samatha, C., 2012. Study on infestation of cotton insect stainers on Bt-cotton and non Bt-cotton in Warangal, Andhra Pradesh. *J. environ. Sci.*, **3**: 1155-1160.
- Serebrov, V.V., Khodyrev, V.P., Gerber, O.N. and Tsvetkova, V.P., 2005. Perspectives of combined use of entomopathogenic fungi and chemical insecticides against Colorado beetle (*Leptinotarsa decemlineata*). *Mikol. Fitopatol.*, **39**: 89-98.
- Shah, S.I.A., 2014. The cotton stainer (*Dysdercus koenigii*): An emerging serious threat for cotton crop in Pakistan. *Pakistan J. Zool.*, **46**: 329-335.
- Shariffard, M., Mossadegh, M.S., Vazirianzadeh, B. and Mahmoudabadi, A.Z., 2011. Interactions between entomopathogenic fungus, *Metarhizium anisopliae* and sublethal doses of spinosad for control of house fly, *Musca domestica*. *Iran. J. Arthropod Borne Dis.*, **5**: 28-36.
- Thompson, S.R. and Brandeburg, R.L., 2006. Effect of combining imidacloprid and Diatomaceous earth with *Beauveria bassiana* on mole cricket (Orthoptera: Gryllotapiade) mortality. *J. econ. Ent.*, **99**: 1948-1954. <https://doi.org/10.1093/jee/99.6.1948>
- Ujian, A.A. and Shahzad, S., 2007. Pathogenicity of *Metarhizium anisopliae* var. *acridum* strains on pink hibiscus mealy bug (*Maconellicoccus hirsutus*) affecting cotton crop. *Pakistan J. Bot.*, **39**: 967-973.
- Wang, X., Li, X., Shen, A. and Wu, Y., 2011. Baseline susceptibility of the diamondback moth

- (Lepidoptera: Plutellidae) to chlorantraniliprole in China. *J. econ. Ent.*, **103**: 843-848. <https://doi.org/10.1603/EC09367>
- Ying, S.H., Feng, M.G. and Xu, S.T., 2003. Field efficacy of emulsifiable suspensions of *Beauveria bassiana* conidia for control of *Mysus persicae* population on cabbage in China. *J. appl. Ecol.*, **14**: 545-548.
- Yunus, M. and Yousuf, M., 1979. Insect and mite pests of cotton in Pakistan. *Pakistan J. agric. Sci.*, **16**: 67-71.
- Zimmermann, G., 1993. The entomopathogenic fungus *Metarhizium anisopliae* and its potential as a biocontrol agent. *Pestic. Sci.*, **37**: 375-379. <https://doi.org/10.1002/ps.2780370410>
- Zurek, L., Watson, D.W. and Schal, C., 2002. Synergism between *Metarhizium anisopliae* (Deuteromycotina: Hyphomycetes) and boric acid against the German cockroach (Dictyoptera: Blattellidae). *Biol. Contr.*, **23**: 296-302. <https://doi.org/10.1006/bcon.2001.1012>